# A REVIEW TO ASSESS COMPLIANCE WITH ESTABLISHED ERIE COUNTY PERSONNEL POLICIES AND PROCEDURES FOR RECORDING ATTENDANCE 

As of June 30, 2011


MARK C. POLONCARZ<br>ERIE COUNTY COMPTROLLER

Michael R. Szukala, MBA, CIA
Deputy Comptroller - Audit \& Control

To the Honorable Erie County Legislature:
On September 30, 2009, the Erie County Comptroller's Office issued an audit report of the Department of Personnel regarding the County's payroll records. One of our major findings was the absence of recording of time worked. This report is a follow-up to review the current status of similar payroll records and to assess compliance with established Erie County Personnel Policies and Procedures for recording attendance. We examined records found on the County's ESS system, often referred to as the "Swipe" system.

## OBJECTIVES

The objectives of our review were to:

- Determine how many County departments are not currently utilizing the ESS system.
- Determine how many employees are not utilizing the ESS system contrary to Erie County Personnel Policies and Procedures, Chapter 6, Section 1.


## BACKGROUND

In 2008, the County began implementation of the employee self service "swipe card" timekeeping system ("ESS") to replace the paper "sign-in, sign-out" sheets. The ESS system was touted as a means to both save time and minimize abuse. Allegedly, ESS would remove much of the labor involved in the processing of the County's payroll by eliminating most of the data entry work. Under the previous system, payroll clerks entered payroll data for all employees. The ESS system, which compels employees to record their own time through "swipes" of an ID card and enter their own payroll time off, was intended to eliminate nearly all payroll clerk tasks. Additionally, the use of swipe cards purportedly would reduce fraudulent payroll entries.

It should be noted that Erie County Personnel Policies and Procedures require all "employees [to] accurately record their attendance at work by swiping their employee identification badge[s]." The only exceptions to this policy are for employees who work in County Departments that have not currently transitioned to the swipe card system or are unable to adopt the swipe system due to the nature or location of their work done and all elected officials (county executive, comptroller, clerk, district attorney, sheriff and legislators), who must record work hours over a three consecutive month period in order to estimate the hours worked for a full year.

This review does not discuss the savings from implementing the ESS system and does not touch on the purported reduction in fraudulent payroll entries. Our review was limited to the objectives stated above.

For an employee to record his or her time in ESS, that employee uses a specially coded County ID card. The card is waved near an ESS sensor. This act, called "swiping," records the time the employee arrived and left for the day, and the employee's departure and return from lunch.

When an employee fails to record the requisite number of swipes in a day (two: In, Out; or four: In, Lunch Out, Lunch In, Out) the system records the exception "Unauthorized Unpaid Leave," which must be changed to one of a number acceptable types of leave and then submitted to their direct supervisor for approval before that time will count towards their bi-weekly pay.

Not all County buildings have installed ESS sensors, and not all County ID's are coded for the ESS system.

Please note that the ESS system is independent of the County's access controls over secure areas. It is possible to have an ID activated to allow access to a County secure area but not have that ID activated for the ESS payroll system.

## FINDINGS

1. As of June 30, 2011, eight departments (divisions) are still not utilizing the County's ESS system. In our initial review back in 2009, thirteen (13) departments (divisions) were not using the ESS system. Since 2009, five of those departments received access to ESS and began "swiping." Those departments (divisions) that are swiping and those that are not are listed in Schedule A.

WE RECOMMEND that the County finalize the implementation of the ESS system and take the necessary steps required to provide the ESS attendance recording capabilities to the remaining departments or divisions.
2. Our 2009 audit also showed that certain department heads and deputies were not utilizing the swipe system while all other employees within their departments were. Of the nineteen (19) such employees not swiping in 2009, five are still not swiping today. In addition, two other department heads and one senior staff member have also not been swiping. Schedule A shows those individuals not currently swiping.

Chapter VI, Section 1, of the Erie County Personnel Policies and Procedures Manual (effective as of April 14, 2009) states that "employees must accurately record their attendance at work by swiping their employee identification badge at their designated employee swipe card reader(s)."

WE RECOMMEND that the County take the appropriate action to ensure that these eight employees and all such other County employees are in compliance with this established County policy.
3. We briefly reviewed SAP payroll records and listed employees that were not swiping when either swiping capabilities existed at their work location and/or other employees within their cost center were swiping. Forty-seven (47) employees were noted as not swiping as of June 30, 2011. Eight of the Forty-seven (47) employees were the department heads/senior staff previously noted. Twenty-three (23) employees had swipe capabilities at their work location but did not have ID cards that were activated for swiping. The remaining sixteen (16) individuals were active employees that were not swiping for reason(s) unknown. (See Schedule B)

WE RECOMMEND that the County take whatever steps are required to activate the swipe cards for those twenty-three (23) employees in question Further, WE RECOMMEND that the County determine why the other sixteen (16) employees are not swiping and take the appropriate steps to commence swiping as required.
4. We expanded our review of departments in Finding 1 and listed the various locations within the departments from Schedule A that did not have swipe capabilities. To the best of our knowledge, there are still at least sixty-three (63) separate locations in Erie County that are not swiping (See Schedule C). While we acknowledge that the possibility exists that certain locations may not be able to readily adopt the ESS system due to a variety of reasons, we believe every reasonable effort should be made to provide the ability to swipe at every location.

WE RECOMMEND that the County take the appropriate and timely steps as necessary to place swipe card readers at these locations so that employees may begin swiping in accordance with the intentions of County management. Obviously, implementation should not be considered at remote locations where the costs would outweigh the benefits.

## ERIE COUNTY COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE

CC: Hon. Christopher Collins, County Executive John Greenan, Commissioner of Personnel<br>Erie County Fiscal Stability Authority

| DATE |
| :---: |
| STARTED |
| N/A |
| - |
| $12 / 3 / 2010$ |
| - |
| N/A |
| - | Current Deputy County Executive and Sr

Exec Asst CE not swiping


 Commissioner not swiping Commissioner not swiping; current
Deputy swiping

Commissioner not swiping
Commissioner started swiping Jan 2010
 Executive Director not swiping Commissioner started swiping Feb 2010


| SWIPE | DATE |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\underline{2009}$ | STARTED | COMMENTS \& EXCEPTIONS |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 8/17/2009 |  |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 11/9/2009 | Former County Attorney not swiping |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 2/17/2009 |  |
| Yes | 8/17/2009 | Former Deputy County Executive not swiping |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 1/20/2009 |  |
|  |  | Commissioner and Deputies(2) not swiping until |
| Yes | 9/29/2008 | November 2009 |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | Jan-09 | Commissioner not swiping |
| Yes | 9/29/2008 | Director not swiping until November 2009 |
| Yes | Feb-09 | Commissioner and former Deputy not swiping |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | Mar-09 | Commissioner not swiping |
| Yes | 10/7/2008 | Commissioner not swiping |
| No | N/A |  |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 1/20/2009 |  |
| Yes | 7/27/2009 | Executive Director not swiping |
| Yes | 12/23/2008 | Commissioner not swiping until November 2009 |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 9/29/2008 | Commissioner not swiping until November 2009 |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 1/21/2009 | Director not swiping until November 2009 |
| Yes | 1/20/2009 | Director not swiping until November 2009 |
| Yes | 12/22/2008 | Commissioner not swiping until November 2009 |
| No | N/A |  |
| No | N/A | Commissioner not swiping |
| No | N/A |  |
| Yes | 4/24/2009 | Former Veterans Svc Officer not swiping |
| Yes | Mar-09 |  |

DEPARTMENT

County Executive District Attorney DISS
DPW - Administration DPW Highway Districts DSS
EEO
E\&P
Emergency Services
Health
Labor Relations Legislature Library bealth
Office of Disabled
Parks and Recreation - Admin



Real Property Senior Services
Shew
Stop DWI
N
N
N
$\stackrel{0}{0}$
$>$
Youth Services
NOTE: For those employees not swiping, the possibility exists for using exception sheets or supplemental time sheets. However, where swiping can be used and it is avoided, the employee is not in compliance with established County policies and procedures.

|  | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{2}$ | $\stackrel{4}{2}$ |  | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ |  | $\stackrel{\sim}{2}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |


| $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ |  | $\stackrel{\square}{\text { co }}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

SCHEDULE B-1

| Swipe |
| :---: |
| Reader |
| Anailab |



$\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$
 $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim} \stackrel{\tilde{\sim}}{\rightleftharpoons}$ $\stackrel{\mu}{\nu} \stackrel{\sim}{\nu} \stackrel{\sim}{\nu}$

 $\stackrel{\sim}{\rightleftharpoons}$ $\stackrel{\sim}{\succ}$ $\stackrel{\sim}{\rightleftharpoons}$ $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ $\stackrel{\sim}{\stackrel{\sim}{\succ}}$

 Erie County Swipe Review 01/01/2011-07/01/2011

|  | $\underset{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\underset{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | ~ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{山}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\underset{\sim}{\sim}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\text { 山 }}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

## LOCATIONS WHERE COUNTY DEPARTMENTS/DIVISIONS ARE NOT SWIPING

Departments and Locations noted in red do not have swipe capabilities

| LOCATION |  | DEPARTMENT/DIVISION | COMMENTS |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Akron | Akron Falls | Parks-Akron Falls Park | Swipe system not installed |
| 1715 Bedell Rd. |  | Library-Grand Island | Swipe system not installed |
| 9475 Boston State Rd |  | Library-Boston | Swipe system not installed |
| 1860 Bowen Rd. |  | Library-Elma | Swipe system not installed |
| 3359 Broadway | Cheektowaga Fire Academy | EMS Training- Fire Academy | Swipe system not installed |
| 5466 Broadway |  | Library-Lancaster District | Swipe system not installed |
| 13280 Broadway |  | Library-Alden | Swipe system not installed |
|  | Grover Cleveland Golf Course | Parks-Grover Cleveland Golf Course | Swipe system not installed |
| 102 Buffalo St. |  | Library-Hamburg | Swipe system not installed |
| 11637 Bullis Rd. |  | Library-Marilla | Swipe system not installed |
| 18 Chapel St. |  | Library-Concord | Swipe system not installed |
| 1929 Clinton St. |  | Library-East Clinton Branch | Swipe system not installed |
| 10 Delaware Ave. |  | Sheriff-Administration | Swipe system not installed |
| 25 Delaware Ave. | Erie County Court Bldg. | Appeals | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | District Attorney-Administration | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Grand Jury | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Lower Courts | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Special Programs | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Superior Courts | Swipe system not installed |
| 40 Delaware Ave. | Holding Center | Jail Management-Administration | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Buffalo Lockup | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Court Security | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Food Service | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-HC Medical Services | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Jail Medical Services | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Programs-HC | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Security-HC | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Jail Management-Transportation | Swipe system not installed |
| 2351 Delaware Ave. |  | Library-North Park Branch | Swipe system not installed |
| 160 Delaware Road |  | Library-Kenmore | Swipe system not installed |
| 2901 E. Church St. |  | Library-Eden | Swipe system not installed |
| 1187 E. Delevan Av |  | Library-East Delevan Branch | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Parks-Forestry | Swipe system not installed |
| 119 Ellicott Rd. |  | East Aurora Highway District | Swipe system not installed |
| 45 Elm St. | Public Safety Bldg | E-911 Services | Swipe system installed, but Sheriff's employees do not swipe |
| Elma |  | Parks-Elma Meadows Park | Swipe system not installed |
| 633 Elmwood Ave. |  | Library-Crane Branch | Swipe system not installed |
| 726 Exchange St. Rm 200 |  | Community Medicaid | Swipe system not installed |
| 92 Franklin | Old County Hall | Legislature-Majority | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Legislature-Minority | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | County Clerk-Actions/Proceedings | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | County Clerk-Pistol Permits | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | County Clerk-Recording | Swipe system not installed |
| 95 Franklin St. | Rath Building | County Clerk-Administration Auto | Swipe system not installed even though in Rath Bldg |
|  |  | County Clerk-Auto Buffalo Branch | Swipe system not installed even though in Rath Bldg |
|  |  | Rath Patrol | Sheriff Dept. employees do not swipe |
|  |  | Welfare to Work | Only one employee is assigned to this location and he does not swipe |
| 2122 George Urban Blvd. |  | County Clerk-Auto East Branch | Swipe system not installed |
|  | Sprague Brook Park | Parks-Sprague Brook Park | Swipe system not installed |
| 1080 Harlem Rd. |  | Lancaster Highway District | Swipe system not installed |
| 2580 Harlem Rd. |  | Library-Reinstein Memorial | Swipe system not installed |
| 770 Hopkins |  | Library-Clearfield | Swipe system not installed |
| 1324 Jefferson Ave. |  | Library-Merriweather Branch | Swipe system not installed |
| 350 JJ Audubon Pkwy. |  | Library-Audubon | Swipe system not installed |
| 1 Lafayette Sq. | Central Library | Library-Borrowers Services | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Library-Business Office | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Library-Cent \& City Branch Maintenance | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Library-Central Public services | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Library-Childrens Services | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Library-Creative \& Prod | Swipe system not installed |
|  |  | Library-Develop and Comm | Swipe system not installed |

## LOCATIONS WHERE COUNTY DEPARTMENTS/DIVISIONS ARE NOT SWIPING

Departments and Locations noted in red do not have swipe capabilities


Library-Aurora
Library-Collins
Library-Eggertsville-Snyder
Library-Williamsville
Library-Kenilworth
Library-Angola
Parks
Library-Niagara Branch
Library-Lackawanna
Clarence Highway District
Library-North Collins
East Concord Highway District
Library-Orchard Park
Library-Dudley Branch
Emery Park
Library-Riverside Branch
Parks-Ellicott Creek Park
Parks-Isle View Park
Library-Clarence
Library-West Seneca
Community Programs
County Clerk-Auto Satellite/Mobile
Employment Assessment

Investigative Service
Leg District Office Staff
Police Patrol Service
Police Support Service
Health-Adult Mental Health Services

Board of Elections
Civil Process
Jail Management-CF Medical Services
Jail Management-Food Service-CF
Jail Management-Programs-CF
Jail Management-Security-CF
Hamburg Highway District
50 West Ave.
608 William St.

Correctional Facility

Jesse E Nash Health Center

Hamburg Highway District

Health-TB Outreach

COMMENTS
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system installed at location - all
4 EC Works employees do not swipe
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Sheriff Dept. employees do not swipe
Swipe system not installed
Of the 68 employees in this dept, 4 are in areas where the swipe system is not installed,
5 are in areas with swiping capability, but are not swiping, and the balance of 59 employees are swiping
Sheriff Dept. employees do not swipe Swipe system not installed
Sheriff Dept. employees do not swipe
Sheriff Dept. employees do not swipe
Swipe system not installed
The 2 employees who work in the
Rath Bldg. do not swipe
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed
Swipe system not installed

## LOCATIONS WHERE COUNTY DEPARTMENTS/DIVISIONS ARE NOT SWIPING

Departments and Locations noted in red do not have swipe capabilities
LOCATION DEPARTMENT/DIVISION COMMENTS

